

Bid Comparison

Contract ID: 610658
Description: HMA Overlay, Shoulders and Pavement Markers
Location: Neuman Road Kennedy Rd to Bridge over Pine River
Projects(s): 610658

| Rank | Bidder | Total Bid | % Over Low | % Over Est. |
|------|------------------------------------|--------------|------------|-------------|
| 0 | ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE | \$71,594.38 | -10.13% | 0.00% |
| 1 | (00656) Ace-Saginaw Paving Company | \$79,670.73 | 0.00% | 11.28% |
| 2 | (_0001) Best Asphalt Inc. | \$108,654.32 | 36.37% | 51.76% |

| Line | Pay Item Code | Quantity | Units | (0) ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE | | (1) Ace-Saginaw Paving Company | | (2) Best Asphalt Inc. | |
|------|------------------------------------|----------|-------|-------------------------|-------------|--------------------------------|-------------|-----------------------|-------------|
| | | | | Bid Price | Total | Bid Price | Total | Bid Price | Total |
| 0001 | 2090001 Project Cleanup | 1 | LSUM | \$1,000.00 | \$1,000.00 | \$500.00 | \$500.00 | \$5,000.00 | \$5,000.00 |
| 0002 | 3077031 _ Shld, CI II, Modified | 180 | Ton | \$33.00 | \$5,940.00 | \$35.00 | \$6,300.00 | \$60.00 | \$10,800.00 |
| 0003 | 5010025 Hand Patching | 5 | Ton | \$150.00 | \$750.00 | \$120.00 | \$600.00 | \$500.00 | \$2,500.00 |
| 0004 | 5012024 HMA, 4EL | 561 | Ton | \$88.00 | \$49,368.00 | \$97.35 | \$54,613.35 | \$127.42 | \$71,482.62 |

| Line | Pay Item Code | Quantity | Units | (0) ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE | | (1) Ace-Saginaw Paving Company | | (2) Best Asphalt Inc. | |
|--------------------|---|----------|-------|-------------------------|--------------------|--------------------------------|--------------------|-----------------------|---------------------|
| | | | | Bid Price | Total | Bid Price | Total | Bid Price | Total |
| 0005 | 8110232 | 4,164 | Ft | \$0.10 | \$416.40 | \$0.19 | \$791.16 | \$0.30 | \$1,249.20 |
| | Pavt Mrkg, Waterborne, 4 inch, Yellow | | | | | | | | |
| 0006 | 8110233 | 5,460 | Ft | \$0.10 | \$546.00 | \$0.27 | \$1,474.20 | \$0.40 | \$2,184.00 |
| | Pavt Mrkg, Waterborne, 6 inch, White | | | | | | | | |
| 0007 | 8120035 | 53 | Ea | \$15.00 | \$795.00 | \$20.00 | \$1,060.00 | \$20.00 | \$1,060.00 |
| | Channelizing Device, 42 inch, Fluorescent, Furn | | | | | | | | |
| 0008 | 8120036 | 53 | Ea | \$0.01 | \$0.53 | \$1.00 | \$53.00 | \$1.00 | \$53.00 |
| | Channelizing Device, 42 inch, Fluorescent, Oper | | | | | | | | |
| 0009 | 8120140 | 2 | Ea | \$400.00 | \$800.00 | \$500.00 | \$1,000.00 | \$500.00 | \$1,000.00 |
| | Lighted Arrow, Type C, Furn | | | | | | | | |
| 0010 | 8120141 | 2 | Ea | \$1.00 | \$2.00 | \$0.01 | \$0.02 | \$1.00 | \$2.00 |
| | Lighted Arrow, Type C, Oper | | | | | | | | |
| 0011 | 8120170 | 1 | LSUM | \$5,500.00 | \$5,500.00 | \$5,000.00 | \$5,000.00 | \$5,000.00 | \$5,000.00 |
| | Minor Traf Devices | | | | | | | | |
| 0012 | 8120246 | 331 | Ft | \$3.00 | \$993.00 | \$3.00 | \$993.00 | \$3.50 | \$1,158.50 |
| | Pavt Mrkg, Wet Reflective, Type R, Tape, 4 inch, Yellow, Temp | | | | | | | | |
| 0013 | 8120350 | 336 | Sft | \$4.00 | \$1,344.00 | \$6.00 | \$2,016.00 | \$6.00 | \$2,016.00 |
| | Sign, Type B, Temp, Prismatic, Furn | | | | | | | | |
| 0014 | 8120351 | 336 | Sft | \$0.01 | \$3.36 | \$1.00 | \$336.00 | \$1.00 | \$336.00 |
| | Sign, Type B, Temp, Prismatic, Oper | | | | | | | | |
| 0015 | 8120352 | 9 | Sft | \$4.00 | \$36.00 | \$75.00 | \$675.00 | \$6.00 | \$54.00 |
| | Sign, Type B, Temp, Prismatic, Spec, Furn | | | | | | | | |
| 0016 | 8120353 | 9 | Sft | \$0.01 | \$0.09 | \$1.00 | \$9.00 | \$1.00 | \$9.00 |
| | Sign, Type B, Temp, Prismatic, Spec, Oper | | | | | | | | |
| 0017 | 8120370 | 1 | LSUM | \$3,500.00 | \$3,500.00 | \$3,600.00 | \$3,600.00 | \$3,500.00 | \$3,500.00 |
| | Traf Regulator Control | | | | | | | | |
| 0018 | 8127050 | 1 | Ea | \$600.00 | \$600.00 | \$650.00 | \$650.00 | \$1,250.00 | \$1,250.00 |
| | _ Monument Box, Special | | | | | | | | |
| Bid Totals: | | | | | \$71,594.38 | | \$79,670.73 | | \$108,654.32 |

Bid Comparison

Contract ID: 77052-TWA
Description: Cold Milling, HMA Overlay and Pavt Markings
Location: M-29 City of St. Clair St. Clair County
Projects(s): 77052-TWA

| Rank | Bidder | Total Bid | % Over Low | % Over Est. |
|------|------------------------------------|--------------|------------|-------------|
| 0 | ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE | \$171,719.50 | 16.49% | 0.00% |
| 1 | (00656) Ace-Saginaw Paving Company | \$147,407.70 | 0.00% | -14.15% |
| 2 | (_0001) Best Asphalt Inc. | \$186,465.70 | 26.49% | 8.58% |

| Line | Pay Item Code | Quantity | Units | (0) ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE | | (1) Ace-Saginaw Paving Company | | (2) Best Asphalt Inc. | |
|------|---|----------|-------|-------------------------|--------------|--------------------------------|-------------|-----------------------|--------------|
| | | | | Bid Price | Total | Bid Price | Total | Bid Price | Total |
| 0001 | 5012036 HMA, 5EL | 1,010 | Ton | \$120.00 | \$121,200.00 | \$97.00 | \$97,970.00 | \$121.32 | \$122,533.20 |
| 0002 | 5017011 _ Cold Milling HMA Surface, Modified | 11,080 | Syd | \$2.00 | \$22,160.00 | \$2.10 | \$23,268.00 | \$3.25 | \$36,010.00 |
| 0003 | 8110039 Pavt Mrkg, Ovly Cold Plastic, 12 inch, Cross Hatching, White | 264 | Ft | \$2.00 | \$528.00 | \$5.95 | \$1,570.80 | \$6.00 | \$1,584.00 |
| 0004 | 8110071 Pavt Mrkg, Ovly Cold Plastic, Rt Turn Arrow Sym | 3 | Ea | \$300.00 | \$900.00 | \$195.00 | \$585.00 | \$165.00 | \$495.00 |

| Line | Pay Item Code | Quantity | Units | (0) ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE | | (1) Ace-Saginaw Paving Company | | (2) Best Asphalt Inc. | |
|--------------------|---|----------|-------|-------------------------|---------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------|-----------------------|---------------------|
| | | | | Bid Price | Total | Bid Price | Total | Bid Price | Total |
| 0005 | 8110233 | 3,020 | Ft | \$0.15 | \$453.00 | \$0.27 | \$815.40 | \$0.40 | \$1,208.00 |
| | Pavt Mrkg, Waterborne, 6 inch, White | | | | | | | | |
| 0006 | 8110234 | 7,550 | Ft | \$0.15 | \$1,132.50 | \$0.27 | \$2,038.50 | \$0.40 | \$3,020.00 |
| | Pavt Mrkg, Waterborne, 6 inch, Yellow | | | | | | | | |
| 0007 | 8110253 | 3,020 | Ft | \$0.10 | \$302.00 | \$0.20 | \$604.00 | \$0.25 | \$755.00 |
| | Pavt Mrkg, Waterborne, 2nd Application, 6 inch, White | | | | | | | | |
| 0008 | 8110254 | 7,550 | Ft | \$0.10 | \$755.00 | \$0.20 | \$1,510.00 | \$0.25 | \$1,887.50 |
| | Pavt Mrkg, Waterborne, 2nd Application, 6 inch, Yellow | | | | | | | | |
| 0009 | 8120035 | 40 | Ea | \$16.00 | \$640.00 | \$20.00 | \$800.00 | \$20.00 | \$800.00 |
| | Channelizing Device, 42 inch, Fluorescent, Furn | | | | | | | | |
| 0010 | 8120036 | 40 | Ea | \$1.00 | \$40.00 | \$1.00 | \$40.00 | \$1.00 | \$40.00 |
| | Channelizing Device, 42 inch, Fluorescent, Oper | | | | | | | | |
| 0011 | 8120140 | 2 | Ea | \$350.00 | \$700.00 | \$500.00 | \$1,000.00 | \$75.00 | \$150.00 |
| | Lighted Arrow, Type C, Furn | | | | | | | | |
| 0012 | 8120141 | 2 | Ea | \$100.00 | \$200.00 | \$1.00 | \$2.00 | \$1.00 | \$2.00 |
| | Lighted Arrow, Type C, Oper | | | | | | | | |
| 0013 | 8120170 | 1 | LSUM | \$10,000.00 | \$10,000.00 | \$6,500.00 | \$6,500.00 | \$7,500.00 | \$7,500.00 |
| | Minor Traf Devices | | | | | | | | |
| 0014 | 8120350 | 360 | Sft | \$3.50 | \$1,260.00 | \$6.00 | \$2,160.00 | \$6.00 | \$2,160.00 |
| | Sign, Type B, Temp, Prismatic, Furn | | | | | | | | |
| 0015 | 8120351 | 360 | Sft | \$0.50 | \$180.00 | \$1.00 | \$360.00 | \$1.00 | \$360.00 |
| | Sign, Type B, Temp, Prismatic, Oper | | | | | | | | |
| 0016 | 8120370 | 1 | LSUM | \$10,000.00 | \$10,000.00 | \$4,800.00 | \$4,800.00 | \$5,000.00 | \$5,000.00 |
| | Traf Regulator Control | | | | | | | | |
| 0017 | 8122000 | 242 | Ft | \$1.50 | \$363.00 | \$4.00 | \$968.00 | \$3.50 | \$847.00 |
| | Pavt Mrkg, Wet Reflective, Type R, Tape, 6 inch, White, Temp | | | | | | | | |
| 0018 | 8122002 | 604 | Ft | \$1.50 | \$906.00 | \$4.00 | \$2,416.00 | \$3.50 | \$2,114.00 |
| | Pavt Mrkg, Wet Reflective, Type R, Tape, 6 inch, Yellow, Temp | | | | | | | | |
| Bid Totals: | | | | | \$171,719.50 | | \$147,407.70 | | \$186,465.70 |

Bid Comparison

Contract ID: 610653
Description: Crush & Shape, 2 inch HMA, Shoulders and Pavement Markings
Location: Puttygut Road Range Rd to M-29
Projects(s): 610653

| Rank | Bidder | Total Bid | % Over Low | % Over Est. |
|------|------------------------------------|--------------|------------|-------------|
| 0 | ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE | \$227,319.03 | -10.35% | 0.00% |
| 1 | (00656) Ace-Saginaw Paving Company | \$253,565.65 | 0.00% | 11.54% |
| 2 | (_0001) Best Asphalt Inc. | \$318,678.20 | 25.67% | 40.18% |

| Line | Pay Item Code | Quantity | Units | (0) ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE | | (1) Ace-Saginaw Paving Company | | (2) Best Asphalt Inc. | |
|------|---|----------|-------|-------------------------|-------------|--------------------------------|-------------|-----------------------|-------------|
| | | | | Bid Price | Total | Bid Price | Total | Bid Price | Total |
| 0001 | 2090001 Project Cleanup | 1 | LSUM | \$1,500.00 | \$1,500.00 | \$500.00 | \$500.00 | \$7,500.00 | \$7,500.00 |
| 0002 | 3027031 _ Aggregate Base, Modified | 100 | Ton | \$35.00 | \$3,500.00 | \$60.00 | \$6,000.00 | \$42.00 | \$4,200.00 |
| 0003 | 3057011 _ HMA Base Crushing and Shaping, Mod | 11,123 | Syd | \$3.00 | \$33,369.00 | \$3.05 | \$33,925.15 | \$4.15 | \$46,160.45 |
| 0004 | 3077031 _ Shld, Cl II, Modified | 364 | Ton | \$35.00 | \$12,740.00 | \$30.00 | \$10,920.00 | \$60.00 | \$21,840.00 |

| Line | Pay Item Code | Quantity | Units | (0) ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE | | (1) Ace-Saginaw Paving Company | | (2) Best Asphalt Inc. | |
|------|---|----------|-------|-------------------------|--------------|--------------------------------|--------------|-----------------------|--------------|
| | | | | Bid Price | Total | Bid Price | Total | Bid Price | Total |
| 0005 | 5012025 HMA, 4EML | 1,293 | Ton | \$80.00 | \$103,440.00 | \$88.20 | \$114,042.60 | \$117.00 | \$151,281.00 |
| 0006 | 8110045 Pavt Mrkg, Ovly Cold Plastic, 24 inch, Stop Bar | 37 | Ft | \$20.00 | \$740.00 | \$15.95 | \$590.15 | \$15.00 | \$555.00 |
| 0007 | 8110069 Pavt Mrkg, Ovly Cold Plastic, Railroad Sym | 1 | Ea | \$400.00 | \$400.00 | \$400.00 | \$400.00 | \$500.00 | \$500.00 |
| 0008 | 8110232 Pavt Mrkg, Waterborne, 4 inch, Yellow | 4,967 | Ft | \$0.12 | \$596.04 | \$0.19 | \$943.73 | \$0.30 | \$1,490.10 |
| 0009 | 8110233 Pavt Mrkg, Waterborne, 6 inch, White | 7,511 | Ft | \$0.15 | \$1,126.65 | \$0.23 | \$1,727.53 | \$0.40 | \$3,004.40 |
| 0010 | 8120012 Barricade, Type III, High Intensity, Double Sided, Lighted, Furn | 4 | Ea | \$100.00 | \$400.00 | \$75.00 | \$300.00 | \$75.00 | \$300.00 |
| 0011 | 8120013 Barricade, Type III, High Intensity, Double Sided, Lighted, Oper | 4 | Ea | \$5.00 | \$20.00 | \$0.01 | \$0.04 | \$1.00 | \$4.00 |
| 0012 | 8120170 Minor Traf Devices | 1 | LSUM | \$7,000.00 | \$7,000.00 | \$10,100.00 | \$10,100.00 | \$5,000.00 | \$5,000.00 |
| 0013 | 8120246 Pavt Mrkg, Wet Reflective, Type R, Tape, 4 inch, Yellow, Temp | 384 | Ft | \$3.00 | \$1,152.00 | \$3.00 | \$1,152.00 | \$3.50 | \$1,344.00 |
| 0014 | 8120350 Sign, Type B, Temp, Prismatic, Furn | 148 | Sft | \$4.00 | \$592.00 | \$6.00 | \$888.00 | \$6.00 | \$888.00 |
| 0015 | 8120351 Sign, Type B, Temp, Prismatic, Oper | 148 | Sft | \$0.01 | \$1.48 | \$1.00 | \$148.00 | \$1.00 | \$148.00 |
| 0016 | 8120352 Sign, Type B, Temp, Prismatic, Spec, Furn | 36 | Sft | \$4.00 | \$144.00 | \$6.00 | \$216.00 | \$6.00 | \$216.00 |
| 0017 | 8120353 Sign, Type B, Temp, Prismatic, Spec, Oper | 36 | Sft | \$0.01 | \$0.36 | \$1.00 | \$36.00 | \$1.00 | \$36.00 |
| 0018 | 8127050 _ Monument Box, Special | 2 | Ea | \$600.00 | \$1,200.00 | \$650.00 | \$1,300.00 | \$1,250.00 | \$2,500.00 |
| 0019 | 8507022 _ Asphalt Cement Binder | 16,685 | Gal | \$3.50 | \$58,397.50 | \$4.17 | \$69,576.45 | \$4.25 | \$70,911.25 |

| Line | Pay Item Code | Quantity | Units | (0) ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE | | (1) Ace-Saginaw Paving Company | | (2) Best Asphalt Inc. | |
|--------------------|--------------------------|----------|-------|-------------------------|---------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------|-----------------------|---------------------|
| | | | | Bid Price | Total | Bid Price | Total | Bid Price | Total |
| 0020 | 8507031 | 2 | Ton | \$500.00 | \$1,000.00 | \$400.00 | \$800.00 | \$400.00 | \$800.00 |
| | _ Portland Cement Binder | | | | | | | | |
| Bid Totals: | | | | | \$227,319.03 | | \$253,565.65 | | \$318,678.20 |

Bid Comparison

Contract ID: 610663
Description: Crush & Shape, 2 inch HMA, Shoulders and Pavement Markings
Location: Shortcut Road Marsh Rd to 3100' West
Projects(s): 610663

| Rank | Bidder | Total Bid | % Over Low | % Over Est. |
|------|------------------------------------|--------------|------------|-------------|
| 0 | ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE | \$179,816.29 | -9.55% | 0.00% |
| 1 | (00656) Ace-Saginaw Paving Company | \$198,803.89 | 0.00% | 10.55% |
| 2 | (_0001) Best Asphalt Inc. | \$241,234.50 | 21.34% | 34.15% |

| Line | Pay Item Code | Quantity | Units | (0) ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE | | (1) Ace-Saginaw Paving Company | | (2) Best Asphalt Inc. | |
|------|---|----------|-------|-------------------------|-------------|--------------------------------|-------------|-----------------------|-------------|
| | | | | Bid Price | Total | Bid Price | Total | Bid Price | Total |
| 0001 | 2090001 Project Cleanup | 1 | LSUM | \$2,000.00 | \$2,000.00 | \$500.00 | \$500.00 | \$10,000.00 | \$10,000.00 |
| 0002 | 3027031 _ Aggregate Base, Modified | 100 | Ton | \$35.00 | \$3,500.00 | \$60.00 | \$6,000.00 | \$42.00 | \$4,200.00 |
| 0003 | 3057011 _ HMA Base Crushing and Shaping, Mod | 8,717 | Syd | \$3.00 | \$26,151.00 | \$3.05 | \$26,586.85 | \$4.25 | \$37,047.25 |
| 0004 | 3077031 _ Shld, Cl II, Modified | 162 | Ton | \$35.00 | \$5,670.00 | \$35.00 | \$5,670.00 | \$60.00 | \$9,720.00 |

| Line | Pay Item Code | Quantity | Units | (0) ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE | | (1) Ace-Saginaw Paving Company | | (2) Best Asphalt Inc. | |
|--------------------|--|----------|-------|-------------------------|---------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------|-----------------------|---------------------|
| | | | | Bid Price | Total | Bid Price | Total | Bid Price | Total |
| 0005 | 5010008 | 32 | Syd | \$10.00 | \$320.00 | \$30.00 | \$960.00 | \$25.00 | \$800.00 |
| | Pavt for Butt Joints, Rem | | | | | | | | |
| 0006 | 5012024 | 960 | Ton | \$85.00 | \$81,600.00 | \$88.50 | \$84,960.00 | \$114.50 | \$109,920.00 |
| | HMA, 4EL | | | | | | | | |
| 0007 | 8110232 | 1,555 | Ft | \$0.15 | \$233.25 | \$0.20 | \$311.00 | \$0.30 | \$466.50 |
| | Pavt Mrkg, Waterborne, 4 inch, Yellow | | | | | | | | |
| 0008 | 8110233 | 6,200 | Ft | \$0.20 | \$1,240.00 | \$0.30 | \$1,860.00 | \$0.40 | \$2,480.00 |
| | Pavt Mrkg, Waterborne, 6 inch, White | | | | | | | | |
| 0009 | 8120012 | 5 | Ea | \$100.00 | \$500.00 | \$75.00 | \$375.00 | \$75.00 | \$375.00 |
| | Barricade, Type III, High Intensity, Double Sided, Lighted, Furn | | | | | | | | |
| 0010 | 8120013 | 5 | Ea | \$5.00 | \$25.00 | \$0.01 | \$0.05 | \$1.00 | \$5.00 |
| | Barricade, Type III, High Intensity, Double Sided, Lighted, Oper | | | | | | | | |
| 0011 | 8120170 | 1 | LSUM | \$7,000.00 | \$7,000.00 | \$10,100.00 | \$10,100.00 | \$3,500.00 | \$3,500.00 |
| | Minor Traf Devices | | | | | | | | |
| 0012 | 8120246 | 248 | Ft | \$3.00 | \$744.00 | \$3.00 | \$744.00 | \$3.50 | \$868.00 |
| | Pavt Mrkg, Wet Reflective, Type R, Tape, 4 inch, Yellow, Temp | | | | | | | | |
| 0013 | 8120350 | 200 | Sft | \$4.00 | \$800.00 | \$6.00 | \$1,200.00 | \$6.00 | \$1,200.00 |
| | Sign, Type B, Temp, Prismatic, Furn | | | | | | | | |
| 0014 | 8120351 | 200 | Sft | \$0.01 | \$2.00 | \$1.00 | \$200.00 | \$1.00 | \$200.00 |
| | Sign, Type B, Temp, Prismatic, Oper | | | | | | | | |
| 0015 | 8120352 | 54 | Sft | \$4.00 | \$216.00 | \$6.00 | \$324.00 | \$6.00 | \$324.00 |
| | Sign, Type B, Temp, Prismatic, Spec, Furn | | | | | | | | |
| 0016 | 8120353 | 54 | Sft | \$0.01 | \$0.54 | \$1.00 | \$54.00 | \$1.00 | \$54.00 |
| | Sign, Type B, Temp, Prismatic, Spec, Oper | | | | | | | | |
| 0017 | 8507022 | 13,947 | Gal | \$3.50 | \$48,814.50 | \$4.17 | \$58,158.99 | \$4.25 | \$59,274.75 |
| | _ Asphalt Cement Binder | | | | | | | | |
| 0018 | 8507031 | 2 | Ton | \$500.00 | \$1,000.00 | \$400.00 | \$800.00 | \$400.00 | \$800.00 |
| | _ Portland Cement Binder | | | | | | | | |
| Bid Totals: | | | | | \$179,816.29 | | \$198,803.89 | | \$241,234.50 |